



3.4. Solutions to Tests

3.4.1. Test One Solutions

Problem 1.

$$\neg (A \vee \neg (B \wedge C)) \wedge \neg (\neg B \vee (A \vee B))$$

$$\Leftrightarrow \neg A \wedge \neg \neg (B \wedge C) \wedge \neg \neg B \wedge \neg (A \vee B)$$

$$\Leftrightarrow \neg A \wedge B \wedge C \wedge B \wedge \neg A \wedge \neg B$$

$$\Leftrightarrow \neg A \wedge B \wedge C \wedge \neg B$$

$$\Leftrightarrow (C \wedge B) \wedge (\neg B \wedge \neg A)$$

$$\Leftrightarrow (C \wedge B) \wedge \neg (B \vee A)$$

Problem 2.

A translation manual

	English	FOL
Names	Max, Claire, Jenny, Nancy	same
Predicates	x marry y x is y x is in love with y x is intelligent.	Marry (x, y) x = y InLove (x, y) Intelligent (x)
Functions	the oldest daughter of x the youngest daughter of x	o-daughter (x) y-daughter (x)

Translations

- (1) $[Marry (Max, o\text{-daughter}(Nancy)) \vee Marry (Max, y\text{-daughter} (Nancy))] \wedge \neg [Marry (Max, o\text{-daughter}(Nancy)) \wedge Marry (Max, y\text{-daughter} (Nancy))]$ exclusive sense of OR!
- (2) $Jenny = y\text{-daughter} (Nancy) \wedge Claire = y\text{-daughter} (Nancy)$
- (3) $\neg InLove(Claire, amx) \wedge \neg InLOve(Jenny, Max)$ complete denial!

- (4) $\neg \text{Marry}(\text{Jenny}, \text{Max}) \vee (\text{Intelligent}(\text{Max}) \wedge \text{InLove}(\text{Max}, \text{Jenny}))$ the easiest!
 OR
 $\neg(\text{Intelligent}(\text{Max}) \wedge \text{InLOve}(\text{Max}, \text{Jenny})) \rightarrow \neg \text{Marry}(\text{Jenny}, \text{Max})$ closer to common sense!
 OR
 $\text{Marry}(\text{Jenny}, \text{Max}) \rightarrow (\text{Intelligent}(\text{Max}) \wedge \text{InLove}(\text{Max}, \text{Jenny}))$ closer to logical sense!
- (5) $\neg (\text{Intelligent}(\text{Max}) \wedge \text{InLOve}(\text{Max}, \text{Jenny}))$ partial denial!

Problem 3.

- (1)
- $\{ (A \wedge C) \vee (D \wedge B) \} \models C \vee B$

1.	$(A \wedge C) \vee (D \wedge B)$	
	2.	$A \wedge C$
	3.	C \wedge Elim: 2
	4.	$C \vee B$ \vee Intro: 3
	5.	$D \wedge B$
	6.	B \wedge Elim: 5
	7.	$C \vee B$ \vee Intro: 6
8.		$C \vee B$ \vee Elim: 2-4, 5-7

- (2)
- $\{ (A \wedge C) \vee (D \wedge C), B \} \models C \wedge B$

1.	$(A \wedge C) \vee (D \wedge C)$	
2.	B	
	3.	$A \wedge C$
	4.	C \wedge Elim: 3
	5.	$C \wedge B$ \wedge Intro: 4, 2
	6.	$D \wedge C$
	7.	C \wedge Elim: 6
	8.	$C \wedge B$ \wedge Intro: 7, 2
9.		$C \wedge B$ \vee Elim: 1, 3-5, 6-8

- (3)
- $\{ A \vee \neg B, \neg A \} \models \neg B$

1.	$A \vee \neg B$		
2.	$\neg A$		
	3.	$\neg B$	
	4.	$\neg B$ Reit: 3	
	5.	A	
		6.	B
		7.	$A \wedge \neg A$ \wedge Intro: 5, 2
	8.	$\neg B$ \neg Intro: 6-7	
9.		$\neg B$ \vee Elim: 1, 3-4, 5-8	

- (4)
- $\{ \neg (P \vee Q) \} \models \neg P \wedge \neg Q$

1.	$\neg (P \vee Q)$	
	2.	P
	3.	$P \vee Q$ \vee Intro: 2
	4.	$(P \vee Q) \wedge \neg (P \vee Q)$ \wedge Intro: 3, 1
5.	$\neg P$ \neg Intro: 2-4	
	6.	Q
	7.	$P \vee Q$ \vee Intro: 6
	8.	$(P \vee Q) \wedge \neg (P \vee Q)$ \wedge Intro: 7, 1
9.	$\neg Q$ \neg Intro: 6-8	
10.	$\neg P \wedge \neg Q$ \wedge Intro: 5, 9	

Bonus:

$$\{(Small(a) \wedge Smaller(a, b)) \vee (Large(b) \wedge Smaller(a, b)), c = b\} \models Smaller(a, c) \wedge c = b$$

1.	$(Small(a) \wedge Smaller(a, b)) \vee (Large(b) \wedge Smaller(a, b))$	
2.	$c = b$	
3.	$Small(a) \wedge Smaller(a, b)$	
4.	$Smaller(a, b)$	\wedge Elim: 3
5.	$Large(b) \wedge Smaller(a, b)$	
6.	$Smaller(a, b)$	\wedge Elim: 5
7.	$Smaller(a, b)$	\vee Elim: 1, 3-4, 5-6
8.	$c = c$	Refl=
9.	$b = c$	Ind. Id: 8, 2
10.	$Smaller(a, c)$	Ind. Id.: 7, 9
11.	$Smaller(a, c) \wedge c = b$	\wedge Intro: 10, 2

3.4.2. Test Two Solutions

Problem 1

1. $\neg(RightOf(b, d) \vee LeftOf(b, d)) \rightarrow (Cube(b) \vee Cube(d))$
2. $\neg((Larger(b, c) \vee Larger(c, b)) \leftrightarrow (Tet(b) \wedge Dodec(c)))$
or $[(Large(b) \wedge Large(c)) \vee (Small(b) \wedge Small(c)) \vee (Medium(b) \vee Medium(c))] \leftrightarrow [Tet(b) \wedge Dodec(c)]$
3. $(Cube(a) \wedge Cube(c)) \rightarrow [(Small(a) \vee Small(c)) \wedge \neg(Small(a) \wedge Small(c))]$
4. $\forall x [(Cube(x) \wedge FrontOf(x, a)) \rightarrow Larger(x, a)]$
5. $\exists x (Cube(b) \wedge Small(x) \wedge Dodec(x) \wedge FrontOf(b, x))$
6. $\neg \forall x [(Medium(x) \wedge Tet(x)) \rightarrow BackOf(a, x)]$ Partial denial!
or $\exists x [Medium(x) \wedge Tet(x) \wedge \neg BackOf(a, x)]$
7. $\neg \exists x (Cube(x) \wedge Between(b, a, x))$ Complete denial!
or $\forall x [Cube(x) \rightarrow \neg Between(b, a, x)]$
8. $\forall x (Smaller(x, b) \rightarrow Cube(x))$
9. $\forall x (Larger(b, x) \rightarrow Cube(x))$
10. $\forall x [(Cube(x) \wedge FrontOf(x, a)) \rightarrow BackOf(x, b)]$ Cross-reference!

Problem 2.

$$\begin{aligned} & \neg [\exists y (Tet(y) \wedge Large(y)) \wedge \forall y (Tet(y) \rightarrow \neg Large(y))] \\ \Leftrightarrow & \neg \exists y (Tet(y) \wedge Large(y)) \vee \neg \forall y (Tet(y) \rightarrow \neg Large(y)) \\ \Leftrightarrow & \forall y \neg (Tet(y) \wedge Large(y)) \vee \exists y \neg (Tet(y) \rightarrow \neg Large(y)) \\ \Leftrightarrow & \forall y (\neg Tet(y) \vee \neg Large(y)) \vee \exists y (Tet(y) \wedge \neg \neg Large(y)) \\ \Leftrightarrow & \forall y (Tet(y) \rightarrow \neg Large(y)) \vee \exists y (Tet(y) \wedge Large(y)) \\ \Leftrightarrow & \forall x (Tet(x) \rightarrow \neg Large(x)) \vee \exists y (Tet(y) \wedge Large(y)) \end{aligned}$$

Problem 3

- (1) All small cubes are in back of a .
- (2) Some large dodecahedron is to the right of some/a cube.
- (3) Not all cubes are to the left of a .
- (4) No large dodecahedron is in back of a .

Partial denial!
Complete denial!

Problem 4.

- (1)
- | | |
|--|--------------------------|
| 1. $\forall x (Cube(x) \rightarrow Small(x))$ | |
| 2. $\forall x (Small(x) \rightarrow BackOf(x, b))$ | |
| (e) | |
| 3. $Cube(e) \rightarrow Small(e)$ | \forall Elim: 1 |
| 4. $Small(e) \rightarrow BackOf(e, b)$ | \forall Elim: 2 |
| 5. $Cube(e)$ | |
| 6. $Small(e)$ | \rightarrow Elim: 3, 5 |
| 7. $BackOf(e, b)$ | \rightarrow Elim: 4, 6 |
| 8. $Cube(e) \rightarrow BackOf(e, b)$ | \rightarrow Intro: 5-7 |
| 9. $\forall x (Cube(x) \rightarrow BackOf(x, b))$ | \forall Intro: (e)-8 |

- (2)
- | | |
|---|--------------------------|
| 1. $\forall x (Small(x) \rightarrow Cube(x))$ | |
| 2. $\exists x \neg Cube(x)$ | |
| (b) | |
| 3. $\neg Cube(b)$ | |
| 4. $Small(b) \rightarrow Cube(b)$ | \forall Elim: 1 |
| 5. $Small(b)$ | |
| 6. $Cube(b)$ | \rightarrow Elim: 5, 4 |
| 7. $Cube(b) \wedge \neg Cube(b)$ | \wedge Intro: 3, 6 |
| 8. $\neg Small(b)$ | \neg Intro: 5-7 |
| 9. $\exists x \neg Small(x)$ | \exists Intro: 8 |
| 10. $\exists x \neg Small(x)$ | \exists Elim: 2, (b)-9 |

3.4.3. Test Three Solutions**Problem 1**

- (1) $\exists x \forall y (x \neq y \rightarrow RightOf(x, y))$ or $\exists x \forall y RightOf(x, y)$
- (2) $\forall x \exists y (RightOf(x, y) \wedge x \neq y)$ or $\forall x \exists y RightOf(x, y)$
- (3) $\forall x [Cube(x) \rightarrow \exists y (Dodec(y) \wedge LeftOf(x, y))]$
- (4) $\forall x [\forall y (Cube(y) \rightarrow FrontOf(x, y)) \rightarrow (Tet(x) \wedge Small(x))]$
- (5) $\forall x [\neg \exists y FrontOf(y, x) \rightarrow Small(x)]$
- (6) $\neg \forall x [Cube(x) \rightarrow \exists y (Tet(y) \wedge Small(y) \wedge FrontOf(x, y))]$
- (7) $\exists x [Tet(x) \wedge \exists y (Cube(y) \wedge \neg (Larger(x, y) \vee Smaller(x, y)))]$
or $\exists x [Tet(x) \wedge \exists y (Cube(y) \wedge \neg Smaller(x, y))]$
- (8) $\exists x [Cube(x) \wedge \forall y (x \neq y \rightarrow Larger(x, y))]$
- (9) $Cube(a) \wedge \forall x [(Cube(x) \wedge x \neq a) \rightarrow \exists y (Dodec(y) \wedge FrontOf(x, y))] \wedge \neg \exists x [Dodec(x) \wedge FrontOf(a, x)]$

- (10) $\exists x [\neg \text{Cube}(x) \wedge \forall y (\text{Tet}(y) \rightarrow \text{BackOf}(x, y))] \wedge \forall x [\text{Cube}(x) \rightarrow \neg \forall y (\text{Tet}(y) \rightarrow \text{BackOf}(x, y))]$
- (11) $\exists x \exists y [\text{Cube}(x) \wedge \text{FrontOf}(x, a) \wedge \text{Cube}(y) \wedge \text{FrontOf}(y, a) \wedge x \neq y]$
- (12) $\forall x \forall y [(\text{Small}(x) \wedge \text{Cube}(x) \wedge \text{Small}(y) \wedge \text{Cube}(y)) \rightarrow y = x]$
- (13) $\exists x \{ \text{Cube}(x) \wedge \text{FrontOf}(x, b) \wedge \forall y [(\text{Cube}(y) \wedge \text{FrontOf}(y, b)) \rightarrow y = x] \}$
- (14) $\exists x [\text{Cube}(x) \wedge \forall y (\text{Cube}(y) \rightarrow y = x) \wedge \text{FrontOf}(x, b)]$
- (15) $\exists x [\text{Cube}(x) \wedge \forall y (\text{Cube}(y) \rightarrow y = x) \wedge \exists y (\text{Dodec}(y) \wedge \text{FrontOf}(x, y)) \wedge \exists y (\text{Tet}(y) \wedge \text{BackOf}(x, y))]$

Problem 2

- (1) Some large block (the specific one) is in back of every small block. (True)
- (2) Every small block is in front of some large block (some unspecified one). (True)
- (3) No cube is to the left of all large tetrahedrons. (False)
- (4) Not all cubes are in front of some dodecahedron. (True)
- (5) There is at most one large tetrahedron. (True)
- (6) There are exactly two tetrahedrons. (True)
- (7) The tetrahedron is in back of some large dodecahedron. (False)
- (8) There is exactly one tetrahedron in back of some large dodecahedron. (True)